

PAUL, WEISS, RIFKIND, WHARTON & GARRISON LLP

1285 AVENUE OF THE AMERICAS  
NEW YORK, NEW YORK 10019-6064  
TELEPHONE (212) 373-3000

LLOYD K. GARRISON (1946-1991)  
RANDOLPH E. PAUL (1946-1956)  
SIMON H. RIFKIND (1950-1995)  
LOUIS S. WEISS (1927-1950)  
JOHN F. WHARTON (1927-1977)

UNIT 5201, FORTUNE FINANCIAL CENTER  
5 DONGSHANHUA ZHONGLU  
CHAOYANG DISTRICT, BEIJING 100020, CHINA  
TELEPHONE (86-10) 5828-6300

HONG KONG CLUB BUILDING, 12TH FLOOR  
3A CHATER ROAD, CENTRAL  
HONG KONG  
TELEPHONE (852) 2846-0300

ALDER CASTLE  
10 NOBLE STREET  
LONDON EC2V 7JU, UNITED KINGDOM  
TELEPHONE (44 20) 7367 1600

FUKOKU SEIMEI BUILDING  
2-2 UCHISAIWAICHO 2-CHOME  
CHIYODA-KU, TOKYO 100-0011, JAPAN  
TELEPHONE (81-3) 3597-8101

TORONTO-DOMINION CENTRE  
77 KING STREET WEST, SUITE 3100  
PO. BOX 226  
TORONTO, ONTARIO M5K 1J3  
TELEPHONE (416) 504-0520

2001 K STREET, NW  
WASHINGTON, DC 20006-1047  
TELEPHONE (202) 223-7300

500 DELAWARE AVENUE, SUITE 200  
POST OFFICE BOX 32  
WILMINGTON, DE 19899-0032  
TELEPHONE (302) 655-4410

June 4, 2020

**VIA ECF**

Honorable Margo K. Brodie  
United States District Court  
Eastern District of New York  
225 Cadman Plaza East  
Brooklyn, New York 11201

Re: *Federal Defenders of New York, Inc. v. Federal Bureau of Prisons, et al.*, No. 19-cv-00660 (E.D.N.Y.)

Dear Judge Brodie:

I write to update the Court on the parties' ongoing efforts to address several of the important issues raised in this litigation through mediation.

**I. Background**

Since my May 28, 2020 report to the Court, I have corresponded with the parties via email.

This week, my conversations with the Federal Defenders and the Government have focused on the following topics:

MATTHEW W. ABBOTT  
EDWARD T. ACKERMAN  
JACOB A. ADLERSTEIN  
JUSTIN ANDERSON  
ALLAN J. ARFFA  
JONATHAN H. ASHTOR  
ROBERT A. ATKINS  
DAVID A. BAILL  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PAUL M. BASTA  
J. STEVEN BAUGHMAN  
LYNN B. BAYARD  
CRAIG A. BENSON  
ROBERT BERG  
MARCI S. BERGMAN  
DAVID M. BERNICK  
JOSEPH J. BIAL  
BRUCE BIRENBOIM  
H. CHRISTOPHER BOEHNING  
ANGELO BONVINO  
ROBERT BRITTON  
DAVID W. BROWN  
SUSANNA C. BURGEL  
JESSICA S. CAREY  
DAVID CARMONA  
GEOFFREY R. CHEPIGA  
ELLEN N. CHING  
WILLIAM A. CLAREMAN  
LEWIS A. CLAYTON  
YANNONNEE CLEARY  
RACHAEL G. COFFEY  
JAY COHEN  
KELLEY A. CORNISH  
CHRISTOPHER J. CUMMINGS  
THOMAS V. DE LA BASTIDE III  
ARIEL E. DECKELBAUM  
ALICE B. DERNBERG  
ANDREW J. EHRLICH  
GREGORY A. EZRING  
ROSS A. FIELDSTON  
ANDREW C. FINCH  
BRAD J. FINKELSTEIN  
BRIAN P. FINNEGAN  
ROBERTO J. FIZ  
PETER J. FISCH  
HARRIS FISHCHMAN  
ANDREW J. FOLEY  
ANDREW J. FORMAN\*  
HARRIS B. FREIDUS  
CHRISTOPHER D. FREY  
KAREN S. FREY  
ANDREW S. FRIMES  
KENNETH A. GALLO  
MICHAEL E. GERTZMAN  
ADAM M. GIVERTZ  
SALVATORE GOGLIORMELLA  
NEIL GOLDMAN  
MATTHEW B. GOLDSTEIN  
ROBERT J. GONZALEZ  
CATHERINE L. GOODALL  
ERIC GOODISON  
CHARLES H. GOODE, JR.  
ANDREW G. GORDON  
BRIAN S. GRIEVE  
UDI GROFMAN  
MICHAEL J. GOODMAN  
BRUCE E. GUTENPLAN  
ALAN S. HALPERIN  
CLAUDIA HAMMERMAN  
BRIAN S. HERMANN  
MICHELE HIRSHMAN  
ROBERT E. HOLO  
DAVID S. HUNTINGTON  
ANDREW HUNTER  
LORETTA A. IPPOLITO  
JAREN JANGHORBANI  
BRIAN M. JANSON  
JEH C. JOHNSON  
MEREDITH J. KANE  
JONATHAN S. KANTER  
BRAD S. KARP  
PATRICK N. KARNSNITZ  
JOHN C. KENNEDY

BRIAN KIM  
KYLE J. KIMPLER  
ALEXIA D. KORBERG  
ALAN W. KORNBERG  
DANIEL J. KRAMER  
CAITH KUSHNER  
DAVID K. LAKSHDIR  
JOHN N. LANGER  
GREGORY F. LAUFER  
BRIAN C. LAVIN  
XIAOYU GREG LIU  
LORETTA E. LYNCH  
JEFFREY D. MARELL  
MARCO J. MASOTTI  
DANIEL W. MCGRATH  
ELIZABETH R. MCCOLM  
JEAN M. MCLOUGHLIN  
ALVARO MEMBRILLA  
MARK F. MENDELSON  
CLAUDETTE MEREDITH-GOUJON  
WILLIAM B. MICHAEL  
JUDIE NG SHOREY\*  
CAROLYN R. PARADY  
JANE E. O'BRIEN  
ALEX YOUNG K. OH  
BRAD R. OKUN  
KELLEY D. PARKER  
LINDSAY B. PARKS  
VALERIE B. RADOWANER  
JEFFREY J. RECHER  
CAROL A. REISNER  
LORIN L. REISNER  
JEANNIE S. RHEE\*  
WALTER G. RICCIARDI  
WALTER RIEMAN  
RICHARD N. ROSEN  
ANDREW N. ROSENBERG  
JUSTIN ROSENBERG  
JACQUELINE P. RUBIN  
CHARLES F. "RICK" RULE\*  
RAPHAEL M. RUSSO  
ELIZABETH M. SACKSTEDE  
JEFFREY D. SAFERSTEIN  
JEFFREY C. SALJELS  
KENNETH M. SCHNEIDER  
ROBERT B. SCHUMER  
JOHN M. SCOTT  
BRIAN SCRIVANI  
KYLE T. SEIFRIED  
KANNON K. SHANMUGAM\*  
DAVID R. SKLAR  
AUDRA A. SLOWAY  
SCOTT M. SONTAG  
SARAH STASNAY  
TARUN M. STEWART  
ERIC ALAN STONE  
AIDAN SYNNOTT  
BRETT TANNENBAUM  
RICHARD C. TAYLOR  
MONICA K. THURMOND  
DANIEL J. TOAL  
LAURA C. TURANO  
CONRAD VAN LOGGERENBERG  
LIZA M. VELAZQUEZ  
MICHAEL VOGET  
RADMAR WALTER  
LAWRENCE G. WEE  
THEODORE V. WELLS, JR.  
LINDSEY L. WIERSMA  
STEVEN J. WILLIAMS  
LAWRENCE I. WITDORCHIC  
AUSTIN WITT  
MARK B. WLAZLO  
JULIA WENNER MASON WOOD  
JENNIFER H. WU  
BETTY YAP\*  
JORDAN E. YARETT  
KAYE N. YOSHINO  
TONG YU  
TRACEY A. ZACCONE  
TAURIE M. ZEITZER  
T. ROBERT ZOCHOWSKI, JR.

\*NOT ADMITTED TO THE NEW YORK BAR

1. Plaintiffs' desire to increase both the length and number of available videoconferences currently available at both institutions.

2. Defendants' proposal for increasing the length and number of available videoconferences currently available at both institutions.

3. The execution of the current protocol for scheduling and placing attorney-client phone calls at the MDC and the MCC.

## **II. Telephonic Contact**

This was the seventh week in which the parties scheduled and facilitated legal phone calls under the Court Protocol for Attorney Calls and Teleconference Hearings. Pursuant to the Protocol, attorney-client calls were scheduled by Federal Defenders for afternoon slots of one-half hour each from 12pm to 3pm at the MDC and 1 to 3:30 pm at the MCC.

### A. MCC

According to the information I have from MCC and Federal Defenders, MCC received 135 requests for phone calls since May 29, 2020. Each of these calls was either completed, attempted, or cancelled at the attorney's request. Once again this week, I received information from Federal Defenders raising concerns about inmate privacy during a legal call at MCC, this time about a call in the SHU. The MCC has been made aware of this issue.

### B. MDC

According to the information I have from the Federal Defenders, MDC received 152 call requests since May 29, 2020. We are still reviewing completion data from MDC for these calls. However, I note that Federal Defenders once again raised a concern about inmate privacy during an MDC legal call. Federal Defenders report that an inmate in SHU was required to take his legal call within his SHU cell with a cellmate present. MDC has been made aware of this allegation.

## **III. Videoconferencing**

### A. MCC

According to both Federal Defenders and MCC's records, there were sixteen videoconferences scheduled to take place this week. Sixteen were completed as scheduled.

### B. MDC

According to Federal Defenders' records, the organization scheduled eight videoconferences at MDC this week. Seven were completed. One did not take place, although the attorney reported attempting to begin the call as scheduled. Additionally,

Federal Defenders reported several technical difficulties that interfered with the quality of the videoconferences, including one technical issue that raised a privacy concern.

MDC also scheduled two videoconferences this week using the courthouse video system. Both scheduled videoconferences occurred. A third videoconference could not be scheduled because of a conflict with two court proceedings and the attorney's schedule. That videoconference has been scheduled for next week.

### C. Proposals for Expanded VTC Access

In their report filed last week Federal Defenders requested access increase to ten VTCs per day for each institution and requested the Government commit to work on a plan and schedule to achieve that goal. ECF No. 64 at p. 2; *see also* May 29, 2020 Status Conference Tr. 16:5-12. During the Status Conference the Government agreed to increase video access and indicated it had begun to work on an interim plan. May 29, 2020 Status Conference Tr. 8:10-18.

During the Status Conference Plaintiffs requested the Government further expand videoconferencing access to conform to the same schedule as in person visitation prior to the COVID-19 crisis. May 29, 2020 Status Conference Tr. 12:21-25.

This week, both institutions put forward proposals to expand videoconferencing access pursuant to Plaintiffs' original request. The proposals were provided to Plaintiffs and the mediation team this week, and are described as increasing videoconferencing capacity by 60 to 69%.

The MDC committed to evaluating the implementation of the expanded hours after two weeks. The MDC has further committed to working with Federal Defenders and the Mediator to determine how to further increase videoconferences in the event circumstances warrant. Should that occur, MDC has agreed to submit a new proposal. Since the release of the VTC proposal, Federal Defenders have maintained that the plan fails to provide meaningful continuous access as required by the Sixth Amendment and BOP's own regulations.

I have asked both institutions to review prior data concerning the volume of in person visitation to see if there are useful comparisons to guide discussions. I will continue discussions with the parties on this issue.

Respectfully,

/s/ Loretta E. Lynch  
Loretta E. Lynch

cc: Sean Hecker, Kaplan, Hecker & Fink  
Seth D. Eichenholtz, U.S. Attorney's Office (E.D.N.Y.)  
Sean Greene, U.S. Attorney's Office (E.D.N.Y.)

Jeffrey Oestericher, U.S. Attorney's Office (S.D.N.Y.)  
David Jones, U.S. Attorney's Office (S.D.N.Y.)